Notes: Energy Vision Working Group  
Meeting 1 (October 9th, 2015)  
Facilitator: Dr. Jonathan Raab, Raab Associates, Ltd  
Contributors: Ricky Peña and Miriam Posner, Penn

I. **VISIONS OF SUCCESS**

The following is compiled (with a slight sorting into buckets) of the opening statements as we went around the room and everyone voiced their aspirations for successful working group process outcomes.

**Consensus, Mutual Learning**
- To identify areas of commonality so that in the future we ultimately have to go out and help the economy grow and minimize initiatives.
- In four meetings we are not going to solve every problem, but it will start a discussion to find some common areas.
- Exciting to see so many different viewpoints, rare
- Concise but comprehensive set of principles so that we can push issue forward and make a reality
- When we learn from one another. Not to a specific short term outcome, but long term.
- To recognize the complexity of this situation and have the discussion. We must respect the disagreements and end with common issues.
- Fix the misinformation/disinformation
- To advance communication and education and take this group of people who have a strong disagreement and find those synergies. We can educate each other on issues. Inability to communicate effectively is commonly rooted in misunderstanding. We believe there is an economic advantage to being transparent.

**Action**
- To walk away with not just slides, but some action would be a success.
- Ability to gather is good, but effectuating outcome is better. We need to be able to act on it and execute an outcome—actual action is key
- Devise a plan that is actionable in a legislature/governor that is largely concerned with rural PA [and not Greater Philadelphia]. Do something here that will articulate why doing this here will fit into other initiatives in rural parts of the state

**Specific Energy Opportunities—Gas, Renewables, Efficiency**
- Gas as a fuel has an important role to play in the future of our economy.
- Want to get to a place primarily using renewables, distributed generation, use whatever energy produced as efficiently as possible
- Utilize the natural resources available in the region
- To come up with a plan that could be a national leader in energy efficiency, conservation, and production with consideration for our health, economy, and environment
- Want Philadelphia to commit to energy efficiency and clean energy.
- To work towards clean energy for it’s a struggle for the world and Philadelphia is at that point, where we need to figure out that future.
- Natural gas here is what sun is to Arizona.

**Economic Development**
- Vision for Philadelphia to be a leader, to show how an energy economy can be the basis for a prosperous economy in general with as little a burden on nature as possible
- How can we sustain an economy around our resources in a smart way?
- Economic development of the region with long-term jobs, attracting clients (more demand).
- Regional economic development also. This is not just a Philadelphia opportunity; it could expand across PA, externalities across region
- Looking for environmentally sustainable solutions to make production better. Centered around continued investments. We want to share the other side of energy production, such as where it goes, and to attract more clients.
- An opportunity for economic development and growth for the region. Also an opportunity for a clean reliable safe energy for the region.
- Philadelphia is at the point where we need to plan the energy future of the city-- create jobs, sustain jobs, preserve the city and environment
- We can have economic growth without increasing carbon pollution. We are interested in this process because of this: want to build a economy that is sustainable. How can our energy hub not be a pollution hub? How these policies meet the people here in Philadelphia? Success is when our plan to move forward, how do we move forward.

II. **Discussion of Opportunities and Challenges**

These were also compiled during our discussion on this topic in side-by-side projected word document. Here we sorted the opportunities and challenges loosely into various buckets for better comprehension.

**Opportunities**

**Overall**
- Gas based energy hub and an energy efficiency/renewable energy plan
- Need a balanced energy strategy
- Improving energy related infrastructure
- Should focus on concrete steps, taking into account near and long-term factors

**Natural Gas**
- Robust natural gas infrastructure and supply in the region
- Gas for grid reliability in short run
- Relatively low cost energy for foreseeable future—this benefits the impoverished
- Use gas for exportable commodities, feedstock/fuel for energy intensive industries
Renewables/Efficiency
- Utility energy efficiency
- Energy efficiency should be an area where we can find common ground
  - The oil and gas industry is dominated by engineers who are hard wired to be efficient.
- Wind and solar
- Plenty of room for improvement on energy efficiency and renewables because haven’t done that much yet

Workforce
- Work force development/training for new energy related jobs
- Capital and Labor alliance on energy jobs
- Philadelphia should live up to its full potential in terms of increasing manufacturing and other jobs (full employment)
- Tethering job creation to unemployment/poverty level

Challenges

Overall
- Tension between expertise of the group and the stakeholders we are trying to address/assist (e.g., poor and unemployed)
- Need fossil fuel as feedstock for certain goods (plastics) so can’t/shouldn’t completely phase out
- PA incentivizes consumption over conservation
- How is the government responsible to citizens?
- Overcoming community opposition in Philadelphia and beyond—need to address the public relations aspect
- Market volatility, need to be flexible

No Consensus on Terminology, Strategy, Economics
- Where does this bridge end? Natural gas needs to be a part of that, whether as a feedstock or fuel
- Baseline agreement on the commonality of facts.
- What do we want to achieve (e.g., addressing unemployment)
- No clear comprehensive overarching energy policy
- Real assessments of costs and benefits, as well as who is paying those costs (equity)
- Accurate communication about relative and acceptable risks
- “Sustainable” meaning is unclear—and needs to be defined (is natural gas part of sustainable definition?); perhaps “balanced” is a better term than sustainable
- Uncertainty of future (around energy resource availability, cost, etc.)
- Real assessments of costs and benefits
- Do we accept that PA is a fossil fuel state and that’s where energy jobs should come from or do we challenge that for a broader framing of energy related jobs?
Politics
- Prioritization in Harrisburg
- Asymmetric political access (and ergo influence) for different energy resources
- Political system not that altruistic—hard to transition from static quo

Environment/Health
- Need to address health and environmental impacts directly
- Health impacts and related costs
- Greenhouse gas emissions
- Environmental impacts of shale extraction

Workforce
- Work force development and job readiness
- Creating higher-skilled pipeline related jobs does not solve lower-skilled unemployment
- Role utilities play in the economy
- Need to develop a qualified workforce (baby-boomers are retiring)

Infrastructure
- Locking in infrastructure that precludes other options, and difficult to turn off
- Pipelines are often lightning rods and pipeline permitting needs to be streamlined
- Consumers (DOD), pipelines, utilities are the ones who are going to deploy capital based on where they think things are going
- Barriers to energy efficiency

III. Topics/Subjects for Principles
These were brainstormed at the very end of the meeting, as potential topics/subjects for crafting principles on as part of homework and on-going discussions and negotiations.

- Job Creation/Economy
- Greenhouse Gas Emissions
- Scope of Energy Vision (timeframe, energy resources, etc.)
- Business Models
- Social Equity
- Sustainability
- Bridge to Low Carbon Future
- Energy Hub
- Consumer Interests—Affordability, etc.
- Energy Mix/Marketplace
- Health
- Environment
- Role of Government